

## CHUUK STATE LEGISLATURE

### House of Representatives

P.O. Box 27 Weno, Chuuk State FM96942

Florence P. Stanley, Chief Clerk

Email: florencestanley@ymail.com Tel # (691)330-2673

August 22, 2012

The Honorable Johnson S. Elimo Governor State of Chuuk Federated States of Micronesia 96942

Re: Overridden of Act 11-23

Dear Governor Elimo:

Pursuant to Rule 9, Section 14 of the Rules of Procedure of the House of Representatives, I am transmitting the subject Act evidencing the repassage by the House of Representatives on the 8th of August at 11:45 a.m, by 17 yes and 0 nay, and the Senate overridden on the 21st of August at 11:40 a.m., by 7 yes, 0 nays as proof of enactment.

I am enclosing copy of Act 11-23 with Chuuk State Law No. 11-12-14 as assigned.

Thank you.

Respectfully,

Chief Clerk, House of Representatives

cc: President Mark Mailo, Senate Speaker Innocente I. Oneisom Legal Office, CSL

BPKRIS OFC. Recid 6/26/12 10:20 a.m.



JOHNSON ELIMO
GOVERNOR
RITIS HELDART
LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR

June 5, 2012

# OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR STATE OF CHUUK

Post Office BOX 189, STATE OF CHUUK, F.S.M. 96942 TEL. (691) 330-2230/4239 FAX: (691) 330-2233

THE HONORABLE MARK MAILO

President Senate 11<sup>th</sup> Chuuk State Legislature Weno, Chuuk, FM 96942 THE HONORABLE INNOCENTI ONEISOM Speaker House of Representatives 11<sup>th</sup> Chuuk State Legislature Weno, Chuuk, FM 96942

RE: VETO OF ACT 11-23

Dear President Mailo and Speaker Oneisom:

I am respectfully transmitting my veto on Act 11-23 pursuant to section 14 (a), Article V of the Chuuk State Constitution. Act 11-23 amended sections 4 [(4) iii], 7,8(1) and adding a new paragraph 8 in Section 8 of CSL 11-12-07. This veto is based on constitutional vagueness of the amendment. The difference between CSL 11-12-07 and Act 11-23 is in section 4 [(4) iii] as follows:

"iii. Gasoline at the rate of five cents (\$.05) per gallon, increasing by 1 cent per gallon from the  $1^{\rm st}$  of each month after XXX thereafter, to a maximum minimum of 10 cents (\$.10) per gallon."

As shown above, the stricken through portions are the original provision of CSL 11-12-07 and the underlined portions are the amended portion as shown in Act 11-23.

The phrase "thereafter, to a minimum of 10 cents (\$.10) per gallon" can be construed in various interpretations. It can be construed as \$.11 cents, \$.12 or even \$100 per month. Tax statutes are construed strictly against the taxing authority.

In tax statutes, the rule is  $\frac{\text{strict construction against taxing}}{\text{authority.}}$ 

This rule of strict construction against the taxing authority was reiterated in <a href="Tandy Leather Company v. United States">Tandy Leather Company v. United States</a>, 347 F.2d 693 (5th Cir. 1965),

". . . In ruling as he did, that the taxpayer had the obligation to show that sales of the articles in suit were not subject to the excise taxes collected, the district judge was misled by the erroneous contention of the tax collector into misstating the rule of proof in a tax case. This is: that the burden in such a case is always on the collector to show, in justification of his levy and collection of an excise tax, that the statute plainly and clearly lays the tax; that, in short, the fundamental rule is that taxes to be collectible must be clearly laid.

"A cardinal rule of statutory construction is that a statute be construed from its four corners and not by singling out a particular word or phrase."

The Hornbook Rule reminds us that tax laws are strictly construed, and that when the letter of the law is subject to more than one interpretation, it must be construed against the imposition of the tax, the rule of interpretation of taxes being:

"that the burden in such a case is always on the collector to show, in justification of his levy and collection of an excise tax, that the statute plainly and clearly lays the tax; that, in short, the fundamental rule is that taxes to be collectible must be clearly laid." Tandy Leather Company, supra, at 694.

#### (emphasis added)

In the case at bar, applying rule of strict construction against the taxing authority on the following,

"Gasoline at the rate of five cents (\$.05) per gallon, increasing by 1 cent per gallon from the  $1^{\rm st}$  of each month thereafter, to a minimum of 10 cents (\$.10) per gallon."

This could mean that the tax rate for gasoline will start from five (\$.05) cents per gallon which will be increase by 1 cent per gallon after the first month without limit after reaching 10 cents per gallon. This mean that the tax rate after one month could reach at an amount which may be left to the determination or discretion of the taxing authority, since there is no maximum rate imposed by law. The tax may be more than the value of the gasoline per gallon. That is just unacceptable in any society.

In view of this, I have no other choice but to exercise my veto power on Act 11-23.

Thank you and I remain.

Sincerely,

JOHNSON ELIMO Governor

File

### AN ACT

Amending sections 4, ((4), iii), 7,8(1) and adding a new paragraph 8 in Section 8, of CSL 11-12-07, and for other purposes.

Be it enacted by the Chuuk State Legislature:

		and the state of t
1	Section 1.	Amendment. Section 4 of CSL,11-12-07 is hereby amended to read as
2	follows:	
3	"Se	ction 4. Sales Tax Imposition. There is hereby levied a tax on first sale in the
4	State of Ch	wuk of all tangible items, except unprocessed and unpackaged items, as
5	follows:	4
6	1.	Tobacço at the rate of one hundred percent (100%) of the sales price.
7	2.	Cigarettes and cigars:
8		i. at a rate of two dollar per pack of 20 cigarettes;
9		ii. at a rate of 10 cents per on cigarette;
10		iii. at a rate of 10 cents per cigar.
11	3.	Alcoholic beverages at the rate of 50%
12	4.	Fuel Taxes
13		i. Diesel, kerosene at the rate of ten cents (\$.10) per gallon.
14		ii. Jet A One at the rate of ten cents (\$.10) per gallon.
15		iii. Gasoline at the rate of five cents (\$.05) per gallon, increasing by 1 cent
16		per gallon from the 1st of each month thereafter, to a minimum of 10
17		cents (\$.10) per gallon.
18	5.	Luxury items at the rate of twenty percent (20%) of the sales price.
19	6.	All other items at a rate of six percent of the sales price."
20	Section 2.	Amendment. Section 7 of CSL 11-12-07 is hereby amended to read as
21	follows:	
22	"S	ection 7. Sales Tax Agreement: Prepayment. The first seller of the items
23	listed in S	ection 4, (other than items in paragraphs 4(i) and (ii) of this Act shall have the

1	option of prepaying all the sales taxes due under that Section in accordance with				
2	I	egulat	ion	s to be issued by the Director of the Department of Administrative Services."	
3	<u>,                                    </u>	Section	13.	Amendment. Section 8 of CSL 11-12-07 is hereby amended to read as	
4	follows:				
5			"S	ection 8. Cigarette tax stamps, prepayment of tax.	
6			1.	The tax levied by Section 4(2)(i) and (ii) must be prepaid at the time and in	
7				the manner required by this section.	
8			2.	The prepayment of tax required by this section is due no later than the time of	
9				first possession of the cigarettes by a person in Chuuk, when those cigarettes	
10				are intended to be or have been sold in Chuuk.	
11			3.	There shall be a rebuttable presumption that any person in possession of more	
12				than 200 cigarettes holds those cigarettes with the intention to sell.	
13			4.	On prepayment of tax required by this section, the Director of the Department	
14				of Administrative Services shall issue one tax stamp for each \$2 of tax	
15				prepaid.	
16			5.	Prepayment of the tax required by this section is evidenced by affixing one tax	
17				stamp to each pack of 20 cigarettes.	
18			6.	The Director of the Department of Administrative Services may refund or	
19				issue new tax stamps in relation to cigarettes with tax stamps affixed if he is	
20				satisfied that hose cigarettes will not be sold in Chuuk.	
21			7.	Any person who sells cigarettes in Chuuk knowing that those cigarettes are	
22				without a current tax stamp as provided by this section shall be guilty of a	
23				felony and shall, upon conviction, be imprisoned for a period not less than	
24				three (3) months and not more than one (1) year or fined not less than \$1000,	
25				or both.	
26		-	8.	This section becomes operative from the date that the Director of the	
27				Department of Administrative Services first makes the declaration referred to	
28				in Section 3 (8)."	

Section 4. Effective Date. This Act shall become effective upon approval of the Governor, or upon its becoming law without such approval. 2 Signed by Innocente I. Oneisom, Speaker House of Representatives Attested: Chuuk State Legislature Florence P, Stanley, Chief Clerk House of Representatives Chuuk State Legislature Signed by: Mark Mailo, President House of Senate Attested: Chuuk State Legislature Songkinita Bossy Chief Clerk House of Senate Chuuk State Legislature pproved by Jonnson Elmo, Gayernor Chuuk State Dovernment Weno, Chuuk State History: H.B. NO.: 11-52 H.S.C.R.: None Overridden: House of Representatives on 8/08/12 @ 11:45 a.m. Yes = 17

House of Senate on 8/21/12 @ 11:40 a.m.

Nay = 0

Yes = 7Nay = 0